

## **CHUBB INSURANCE RESEARCH REPORT**

Over the past 20 years, Chubb Insurance Company has faced repeated legal and PR hits over how it handles institutional sex-abuse and other liability claims. Courts and policyholders from New York to California have accused Chubb of making unusually hard line arguments, saying abuse wasn't a covered "occurrence," refusing to defend, and slow-walking or denying payment even after liability was clear. This has led to judicial pushback and public criticism. Chubb has paid big when forced to, but only after acting like an insurer that "delays, denies, defends." They have also paid compliance fines and are entangled in culture-war public controversies.

### **Pattern of Coverage Denials in Institutional Abuse Cases:**

Beyond the Archdiocese of New York, Chubb companies have repeatedly refused to defend or indemnify institutional clients facing sexual abuse claims, even after many years of collecting premiums. This pattern spans dioceses, schools, and youth organizations nationwide:

1. ***Rockefeller Univ. v. Aetna/Chubb* (N.Y. App. Div. 2024):** Rockefeller University, facing hundreds of child sex-abuse claims tied to Dr. Reginald Archibald, sued several insurers (including Chubb) in 2019 for dragging their feet on claims under New York's Child Victims Act. In Oct. 2024, a New York appeals court said Rockefeller could keep going with its claims alleging that Chubb acted in bad faith and even broke New York's consumer-protection law. Rockefeller said Chubb waited things out by not investigating, not giving coverage decisions, not paying toward settlements, ignoring requests for old policies, and pressuring the school to drop its case. Because those delays forced Rockefeller to pay more than \$700 million itself, the court said it could see a pattern of Chubb protecting its own bottom line over the school and abuse survivors. The case is still active in the trial court.
  - Source: <https://law.justia.com/cases/new-york/appellate-division-first-department/2024/index-no-654425-19-appeal-no-2686-case-no-2024-00112.html>
2. ***Diocese of Trenton v. Century Indem.* (D.N.J. 2025):** The Diocese of Trenton sued four insurers (including Chubb's Century Indemnity) for not working with the diocese on hundreds of sex-abuse cases under New Jersey's revival law. The diocese said that after months of talks, almost nothing got done because Chubb kept dragging things out, arguing over deductibles, which years of insurance applied, and who would cover the growing legal

bills. Chubb was called out for helping in a few cases but ignoring many others, paying bills only once in a while, and not clearly saying what it would and wouldn't cover. Chubb's argument was that its policies pay only for true accidents, not for abuse the Church "knew about," and it wanted detailed information on what the diocese knew. Chubb filed its own lawsuit in 2024, but a judge tossed it out. In June 2025, the diocese dropped its case without saying why. The fight made news and people compared it to the New York Archdiocese's clash with Chubb.

- Source:

- <https://www.insurancejournal.com/news/east/2025/02/13/811825.htm>

3. ***Montague v. Williams (Poly Prep) (E.D.N.Y. 2025)***: Another example of Chubb sitting out a serious abuse case and then fighting the payout. Poly Prep, a top private school in Brooklyn, had already paid settlements over abuse by Coach Phillip Foglietta. Then a new claim under New York's CVA led to a settlement. The school's insurers, Federal Insurance and Aetna (both Chubb companies), refused to put in any money, a stance a court filing called "obstructive and unconscionable." So Poly Prep covered part of it, gave the survivor a settlement, and handed over its rights to go after the insurers. The survivor is now suing Chubb for refusing to settle.

- Source: [https://www.govinfo.gov/content/pkg/USCOURTS-nyed-1\\_21-cv-04054/pdf/USCOURTS-nyed-1\\_21-cv-04054-2.pdf](https://www.govinfo.gov/content/pkg/USCOURTS-nyed-1_21-cv-04054/pdf/USCOURTS-nyed-1_21-cv-04054-2.pdf)

4. ***Los Angeles USD v. Aetna/Chubb (Cal. Super. Ct.)***: In June 2024, LAUSD (the country's second-biggest school district) sued Chubb companies and other insurers for refusing to step in and help with 61 revived student-abuse lawsuits (some going back to the 1950s). LAUSD said the insurers "sat on the sidelines" while the district paid the bills. The case is still going, and LAUSD's claims are being allowed to move ahead.

- Source: <https://news.bloomberglaw.com/litigation/los-angeles-schools-sue-chubb-units-seeking-sex-abuse-indemnity>

5. ***In re Boy Scouts of Am. (Bankr. D. Del.)***: The clearest example of Chubb "paying only when forced" on abuse claims is the Boy Scouts of America bankruptcy. When the Boy Scouts filed in Feb. 2020, they were facing more than 82,000 abuse claims, and there was a major fight over who would pay for decades of harm. At first, Chubb's Century Indemnity dug in and fought the claims, which dragged things out and drew heavy criticism. But in Dec. 2021, Chubb agreed that Century and its affiliates would put \$800 million

into the Boy Scouts' victim fund, helping raise the total to \$2.7 billion and wiping out future abuse claims against Chubb.

- Source: <https://news.chubb.com/2021-12-13-Chubb-Reaches-Agreement-in-Principle-with-Boy-Scouts-of-America>

### **Chubb's "Expected or Intended" Argument Outside of Sexual Abuse Cases:**

1. ***Novell, Inc. v. Vigilant Ins. Co.*, (10th Cir. Apr. 29, 2011)**: Chubb's Vigilant Insurance wouldn't step in to defend Novell in a 2004 slander-of-title case, saying the lawsuit was about intentional wrongdoing and wasn't the kind of "personal injury" the policy covers. The Tenth Circuit agreed.

- Source: <https://law.justia.com/cases/federal/appellate-courts/ca10/10-4102/10-4102-2011-04-29.html>

2. ***Hecht v. Great N. Ins. Co.*, (10th Cir. Apr. 18, 2019)**: Chubb's Great Northern Insurance Co. refused to cover a Colorado developer who was sued for severe domestic abuse, saying the policy doesn't pay for intentional or abuse-related acts. The Tenth Circuit agreed there was no coverage for the assault, battery, or false imprisonment claims, even though Chubb admitted it would have been covered if those exclusions didn't apply.

- Source: <https://law.justia.com/cases/federal/appellate-courts/ca10/18-1244/18-1244-2019-04-18.html>

### **Chubb Has Lost Bad-Faith Cases and Faced Regulatory Penalties:**

1. ***American Guarantee & Liability Ins. Co. v. ACE Am. Ins. Co.*, (5th Cir. 2021)**: In late 2020, a federal appeals court said Chubb's ACE American Insurance Company mishandled a fatal-accident case in Texas. The injured person offered to settle for \$2 million, which was exactly what ACE's policy covered, but ACE said no. The case went to trial and the jury awarded far more. The other insurer that had to pay the extra sued ACE to get its money back. The court agreed: ACE should have taken the fair offer to protect its policyholder. ACE was ordered to pay about \$7.27 million to make up for the extra costs.

- Source: <https://www.hunton.com/hunton-insurance-recovery-blog/chubb-breaches-stowers-duty-owes-7-million-for-rejecting-unconditional-limits-demand>

2. **Regulatory Fines in New York (2022–2025):** Chubb has also run into trouble with regulators. In Dec. 2022, New York’s financial regulator fined several Chubb companies about \$1.1 million for repeatedly filing auto-policy info late with the DMV. Then in Feb. 2025, New York hit Chubb again, but this time in a statewide action against 37 insurers for the same problem, and Chubb’s share was again \$1.1 million. Regulators said on-time reporting is key to protecting consumers and that companies like Chubb had already been told to fix it. So even outside headline court fights, Chubb has fallen behind on basic regulatory rules.

- Source:

[https://www.dfs.ny.gov/system/files/documents/2022/12/ea20221219\\_chubb\\_dmv\\_iies.pdf](https://www.dfs.ny.gov/system/files/documents/2022/12/ea20221219_chubb_dmv_iies.pdf)

### **Public Perception and Broader Reputational Challenges:**

1. **Advocacy groups Call Out Chubb’s Moral Failures:** The Coalition for Just and Compassionate Compensation in New York urged regulators to probe Chubb’s CVA practices and blasted the company publicly, saying, “Chubb knows that every month spent in litigation, another survivor dies.”

- Source: <https://justice4survivors.com/2023/11/24/chubb-insurance-probe-sought-by-new-york-catholic-abuse-victims/>

2. **Culture War hits Chubb back:**

- From 2023–2025, climate activists hit Chubb for not cutting fossil-fuel underwriting fast enough.

- Source: <https://extinctionrebellion.uk/2023/11/10/climate-activists-demand-insurers-chubb-and-aig-rule-out-underwriting-fossil-fuel-projects-in-africa/>

- Conservatives are also attacking Chubb for being “too woke.” In late 2025, Consumers’ Research ran a \$1M campaign calling Chubb “America’s wokest insurer,” citing its DEI and climate policies, its limits on new coal projects, and its support for racial-justice efforts, and even urged federal probes.

- Source:

<https://www.insurancebusinessmag.com/us/news/breaking-news/chubb-under-attack-as-americas-wokest-insurer-551783.aspx>