

# OUR RESPONSE TO CRÈCHE DENIAL

*Here is a copy of Bill Donohue's letter to the cooperative board in Westchester, New York that initially allowed the display of a menorah in the lobby of a building but prohibited the display of a nativity scene. The resolution of this matter is on p. 1.*

December 12, 2024

Mr. William J. Archer  
Property Manager, 16 N. Chatsworth Ave. Cooperative  
Archer Property Management  
105 Calvert Street, Ste. 3  
Harrison, NY 10528

Dear Mr. Archer:

As president of the nation's largest Catholic civil rights organization, it is my job to combat discrimination against individual Catholics and defamation against the Catholic Church.

One of our members lives in your Cooperative and he says that his request to display a nativity scene in the lobby of the building has been denied. As long as all religious symbols are prohibited, there is no legal issue. But such is not the case.

The lobby reportedly has a Christmas tree and a menorah. The tree is a secular symbol, so no problem there. But the menorah is clearly a religious symbol—the candles represent a miracle (see Exodus, chapter 25). This is not a matter of opinion: the United States Supreme Court has ruled that it is.

Therefore, to allow a menorah while prohibiting a nativity scene constitutes discrimination. It should also be noted that the Catholic League currently has a life-size nativity scene in Central Park; a huge menorah will soon grace the same area.

It's all constitutional—we get a permit each year from the Parks Department of the City of New York.

Christmas is upon us. This issue needs to be resolved immediately. If I do not hear from you by December 17, I will assume you are satisfied with your decision. I will then take steps to rectify it.

Thank you for your consideration.

Sincerely,

William A. Donohue, Ph.D.  
President

cc: Erin Mersino, Esq.  
Bartlene Sages

We can be reached by email at: [pr@catholicleague.org](mailto:pr@catholicleague.org)